



Title	Beyond the liberal studies classroom : students as learners of citizenship in the "umbrella movement" in Hong Kong
Author(s)	Leung, Chun-pin; 梁雋翹
Citation	
Issued Date	2015
URL	http://hdl.handle.net/10722/219945
Rights	The author retains all proprietary rights, (such as patent rights) and the right to use in future works.



**BEYOND THE LIBERAL STUDIES CLASSROOM:
STUDENTS AS LEARNERS OF CITIZENSHIP
IN THE "UMBRELLA MOVEMENT" IN HONG KONG**

Submitted by:

LEUNG Chun Pin, Savoy

Student Number:

2011562168

A research dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of Bachelor of Education (Liberal Studies)
at The University of Hong Kong

May 2015

Declaration

I declare that this thesis represents my own work, except where due acknowledgement is made, and that it has not been previously included in a thesis, dissertation or report submitted to this University or to any other institutions for a degree, diploma or other qualifications.

Signed: _____

Leung Chun Pin, Savoy

Acknowledgements

I would like to express my thanks to all respondents who contributed a lot into the completion of this research dissertation. Although they are only students at senior secondary level, their hearty expression and thoughtful sharing during the interviews impressed me a lot. In particular, I would like to extend my thanks to my supervisor, Dr. Ora Kwo, for her support and guidance throughout the research journey.

Dr. Ora Kwo spent countless hours for providing me with insightful comments and suggestions in a number of dissertation meetings and personal consultations, clarifying my thought and research direction, and guiding me to accomplish a high standard of scholarly work. Please let me take this opportunity to express the deepest and sincerest gratitude to Dr. Ora Kwo for accompanying me on the journey of navigating through this research dissertation, and more importantly, the four-year unflinching support for my on-going learning in the University of Hong Kong!

Abstract

The Umbrella Movement resulted in widespread occupations expanding from Admiralty to Causeway Bay, and Mongkok for more than two months in 2014. With its slogan of “Peaceful, Rational, Non-violent and No-swearing,” this movement has been under the spotlight of many international media and highly appreciated by the international societies because it projected a highly “civil” image to the world.

Since the movement was mainly organized, led and sustained by students, and young people will grow up to become future pillars of the Hong Kong society, it is valuable and meaningful to gain more understanding why they participated or did not participate into this movement, and how they perceive, understand and develop the concept of citizenship in response to the movement.

From the interviews with students who have different participation levels in the movement, key aspects considered as learning of citizenship in the Umbrella Movement are identified from their perspective. Hopefully, this research dissertation will enlighten some possible directions and ways how citizenship can be experienced among young students in local context.

Table of Contents

	Page
Declaration	2
Acknowledgements	3
Abstract	4
Table of Contents.....	5-7
List of Tables and Figures	8
 Chapter One: Introduction	 9
1.1 Background.....	9-10
1.2 Research Objectives.....	10-11
1.3 Research Significance.....	11
1.4 Glossary	11-12
1.4.1 Umbrella Movement	12
1.4.2 Participation in Umbrella Movement.....	12
 Chapter Two: Literature Review	 13
2.1 Study of Citizenship.....	13
2.1.1 Citizenship	13-14
2.1.2 Citizenship and Civil Right Movement	14-15
2.2 Umbrella Movement in Hong Kong as Civil Disobedience	15-17
2.3 Citizenship in Liberal Studies	17-19

Chapter Three: Research Design and Methodology	20
3.1 Research Questions	20-21
3.2 The Rationale of Using Qualitative Approach	21-22
3.1.1 Photo Cues	22
3.1.2 Interview Questions	23-24
3.3 Data Collection and Justification	24
3.3.1 Selection of Participants	24-25
3.3.2 The Process of Data Collection.....	25-26
 Chapter Four: Findings and Data Analysis	 27
4.1 Conceptual Understanding of Citizenship	27
4.1.1 Similarity of Understanding Citizenship	27-28
4.1.2 Consistency of Understanding Citizenship between Students and Scholars	28-30
4.1.3 Interrelation among Rights, Responsibilities, Participations and Identities	31-33
4.2 Pressure upon Different Responsibilities and Identities	33-35
4.3 Conflicts in Citizenship.....	35
4.3.1 Conflicts between Civil Society and Civil Disobedience	35-38
4.3.2 Conflicts between Citizenship at a City Level and National Level	38-39
4.4 Citizenship and Umbrella Movement	39
4.4.1 Different Participation Levels and Degrees of Students	40-42
4.4.2 Learning of Citizenship as Participation.....	42-45
4.4.3 Learning of Citizenship in Non-participation.....	46-48

Chapter Five: Discussion	49
5.1 Identity of Students as Citizen	49-50
5.2 Making Sense of Reality	51
5.2.1 The Reality Hurts	51-53
5.2.2 Another Side of Reality	53-56
5.3 Liberal Studies and Citizenship Education	56
5.3.1 Citizenship Education built on Conflicts	56-58
5.3.2 Construction of Global Citizenship	58-60
5.4 Trust in Citizens, Confidence in Civil Society	60-62
64-66	
Chapter Six: Conclusion	63
6.1 Summary	63-65
6.2 Research Limitations	65
6.3 Recommendation and Further Investigation	66

List of Tables and Figures

	Page
Table 1: Curriculum Framework for Liberal Studies (CDC&HKEAA, 2007)	18
Table 2: The Perceptions of Students on the Four Attributes of Citizenship within the Context of Umbrella Movement	31
Table 3: The Participation Levels and Degrees of Students in the Umbrella Movement	40

Reference and Appendices

	Page
Reference	67-69
Appendix.....	70
Appendix 1: The interview account to sum up the responses from six informants during interview	71-76
Appendix 2: The profiles of six interviewees	77-88
Appendix 3: A letter of permission for parents to allow their below-18 children's participation of research	89-90

Chapter One

Introduction

1.1. Background

This dissertation is a naturalistic study which originates from my interest of investigating the influence of the Umbrella Movement on secondary school students. The Umbrella Movement lasts from 28/09/2014 to 15/12/2014 in Hong Kong. The Umbrella Movement, with its slogan of “Peaceful, Rational, Non-violent and No-swearing,” has been under the spotlight of many international media and highly appreciated by the international societies because it projected a highly “civil” image to the world and every Hongkonger.

Umbrella Movement can be seen as a student movement. Initially, adult leaders of the Occupy Central Movement played some roles, but they gradually involved less and less, and finally, they no longer took up the main positions as the leaders or organizers, but simply offered helps for consultation and management affairs in the background. The whole focus was then shifted to students and young generations. The students took the center stage, playing the major role in organizing and veering the course of the movement over seventy-nine days. They also engaged themselves into a series of actions – proposing terms of negotiation, dialoguing with the highest officials of the Hong Kong government, and writing a public letter to ask for a direct dialogue with the President of the People’s Republic of China Xi Jinping. The efforts paid by students and their active participation in the movement were an actual fact that no one can deny. From this angel, the Umbrella Movement is a student-led movement.

During these seventy-nine days, the civic behaviors and acts among young students in the Umbrella Movement were captured by foreign media, and highly appreciated by the international societies. Meanwhile, although the learning of citizenship is not listed as any objectives in the curriculum guide of Liberal Studies, numerous attributes of citizenship can be found from it, such as socio-political participation and identity. Therefore, the study will focus on the understanding of citizenship in Liberal Studies, and bring it into the context of the Umbrella Movement. Most importantly, the study aims at finding out how Hong Kong young students actualize their learning of citizenship whether or not they participate in the Umbrella Movement and how the movement carries impact on their conceptualization of citizenship. The research participants will therefore include students who support the Umbrella Movement, categorized into two types – direct participants and indirect participants, and those who oppose.

Therefore, it is interesting to investigate the perceptions, reflections, interpretations, and practices of citizenship among senior secondary school students (S4 – S6) with different participation levels in response to the Umbrella Movement.

1.2. Research Objectives

Instead of defining “citizenship,” this dissertation aims at enlightening some possible directions and ways how citizenship can be experienced, understood, expressed, interpreted and developed among young students in local context. After all, adolescents are future pillars of the Hong Kong society and therefore it is valuable and meaningful to gain more understanding how they perceive the concept of citizenship and the reasons why they actively participate into this movement. The

objectives of this dissertation are presented in the following:

(1) To identify how students learn different attributes of citizenship in the Umbrella Movement

(2) To investigate the contributions, limitations, and possibilities of Liberal Studies as a subject to develop citizenship among local school students in secondary levels

(3) To evaluate how students understand, interpret and develop citizenship

1.3. Research Significance

To date, I am still unable to find any research on how citizenship develops among students at secondary level in Hong Kong, let alone examine the impact of the Umbrella Movement on students' understanding and development of citizenship. One possible reason for a lack of research on this area can be ascribed to the ambiguous meaning and wide scope of citizenship. Another may be due to the fact that Umbrella Movement is a very recent socio-political incident and situated in local context, and therefore, no research has been to done or published up to the present moment.

1.4. Glossary

Important Phrases often seen in this research dissertation will be explained as follows:

1.4.1. Umbrella Movement

The Umbrella Movement is the largest-scale protest demanding for democracy in Hong Kong's history. Its name is believed to originate from a series of conflict situation that protestors used their umbrellas to defend themselves from the pepper spray used by the police on 26th September 2014. Since then, the umbrella has been recognized as a symbol of defiance and resistance against the HKSAR government all along. The movement lasts for seventy-nine days, starting on 28th September and ended by the clearance of the police in Admiralty on 15th December. There were mainly three occupied sites respectively situated in Admiralty, Mongkok and Causeway Bay. For a short time, Tsim Sha Shui was once occupied for few days.

1.4.2. Participation of Umbrella Movement

Three levels of participation are identified in the research. They are respectively direct participation, indirect participation, and non-participation. Direct participation refers to an individual who went into any occupied site seen as illegal action by the police and the court, in order to show support for the movement. Journalists are excluded as direct participant because it is legal for them to report in there and they are supposed to take a neutral stance toward the movement. Indirect participation refers to an individual who supports the movement by whatever ways, except for showing up or getting into any illegal occupied site in person. Non-participation refers to an individual who does not support, oppose, or have no stance toward the movement. Observers are included in this level of participation even though they once went into the occupied sites out of curiosity or any reasons, rather than supporting the protestors or the movement.

Chapter Two

Literature Review

This research, grappling with two subjects of high controversy in Hong Kong context, ‘Citizenship’ and ‘Umbrella Movement,’ is aimed at understanding the learning of ‘citizenship’ from the subject of Liberal Studies, and how is the concept of ‘citizenship’ developed, practiced and actualized among students at senior secondary levels.

2.1 Study of Citizenship

2.1.1. Citizenship

Delanty (1997) stated that citizenship can be interpreted as the membership in the community expressed in four components – rights, duties (or responsibilities), participation, and identity. Referring to the rights of citizenship, four categories can be defined: civic, political, social and cultural rights. Marshall and Bottomore (1992) once wrote a famous essay to explain the relationship between the first three classic rights and citizenship. When it comes to the duties of citizenship, it can be divided into two main types – formal duties and informal duties. The former includes paying tax to the government, joining military service, attending schools due to mandatory education, etc.; and the latter includes being a responsible and law abiding citizen, committing to the duty of voting, etc., as informal duties. As for citizenship as participation, it is associated with participation in civil society, for example, participating into voluntary service, social movements, or even civil disobedience, which is seen as one form of active citizenship of participation. Sartori (1987)

considers participation as the only effective socio-political involvement in the long term because it stresses on 'taking part in person' rather than 'being part' for the progression of a society. Last, citizenship contributes to the formation of one's identity because citizenship also rest on values. As identity is fluid and subject to different contexts, one's identity in response to the realization of citizenship could vary from the commitment to a particular cause, for example, being patriotic to the country, being absolutely loyal to the political parties, and so on.

Hudson and Slaughter (2007) further pointed out that citizenship is a subject 'moving along the continuum'. Since 1980s, the realization of citizenship had shifted to focusing more on the dimension of participation, with radical democracy and communitarianism getting more popular in well-developed countries; since 1990s, a shift towards identity had taken place in the paradigm of citizenship, as a result both of radical communitarianism and cosmopolitanism. Facing with these two shifts, the understanding of rights and duties unavoidably need to be redefined and reinterpreted.

2.1.2. Citizenship and Civil Right Movement

From bygone days to nowadays, the understandings of 'citizen' or 'citizenship' have been existing on a continuum, with the meaning perceived upon it varying from cultures to cultures, and countries to countries. Traditionally, citizenship is interpreted as certain political practices i.e. civil right movement, particularly referring to specific public rights and duties for a specific political community (Bellamy, 2010). Regarding to this aspect, the history, especially what happened in the last century, has embraced the victories of the civil rights movement, for example, Baltic Chain linking three states in the drive for freedom, African-American Civil Rights Movement aimed

at achieving racial equality in the USA, the Boycott Movement against apartheid in South Africa, and a number of small-scale and large-scale movements striving for a more equal and just society in terms of legal, political and social rights at every corner of the globe. Influenced by theories about post-modernism, post-modernity and post-modernization (Harvey, 1989; Jameson, 1991), new forms of citizenship focusing more on specific social rights have been gradually developed and experienced in the past ten decades, for instance, the emergence of Women's Right Movements, Immigrant Right Movements, LGBC Social Movements (i.e. lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender) and many others. All these movements are led by specific groups of people endeavoring for the recognition of their specific rights and identities. In addition, since 1980s, globalization has brought about much more 'evolving' forms of citizenship, such as transnational citizenship in Europe and even global citizenship, striking people's understanding of citizenship.

2.2. Umbrella Movement in Hong Kong as Civil Disobedience

When it comes to Hong Kong situation, "citizenship" is constantly debated at many dimensions. The Umbrella Movement breaking out in 2014 is considered as the largest civil rights movement in Hong Kong, or even viewed as civil disobedience against the authority. Initially, the Occupy Central leaders had organized a series of workshops over a year and prepared a detailed manual which can be downloaded easily on the Internet (Ortmann, 2015), and finally decided to call for it on 1st October 2014. However, in late September 2014, one-week class boycott campaign was jointly organized by university and secondary school students. And on the last day of it, the student leaders and some others attempted to enter Civic Square, located outside the Tamar Government Headquarter. Those students were soon arrested and

pepper-sprayed by the policemen.

Many Hongkongers were worried about and angry with the violent response to peaceful protests. Eventually, many thousands of people supported students and joined their protests the next days, blocking major roads in Admiralty. It soon resulted in widespread occupations expanding from Admiralty to Causeway Bay, and Mongkok. Since then, students became the driving force of the movement and it was no longer Occupy Central, but ‘transformed’ into Umbrella Movement, lasting for seventy-nine days. It was mainly led by students, demanding for genuine universal suffrage. Therefore, it can be seen that Umbrella Movement is initially rooted in and understood on the model of civil disobedience.

Actually, theoretical and practical roots of civil disobedience should not be neglected. Civil disobedience is usually defined “through social and political struggles experiences” by different social and political scholars. According to Rawls (1972), civil disobedience is the “public, non-violent, and conscientious act,” aiming at influencing government policies, or even making a change in law, which are perceived as unjust. It is a direct political action contrary to law, and its nature is different from other civil rights movement such as petition and demonstration (Zinn, 2007). Thomassen (2007) proceeds further on the same line that civil disobedience is the extended act of public deliberation, and Habermas (1996) also sees civil disobedience as “an important part of a political system where the laws are not fully legitimate.”

When the Chief Justice McEachern of British Columbia gave a court verdict in a case about civil disobedience in 1990, he said “civil disobedience is a philosophical,

not a legal principle,” conveying a message that civil disobedience does not constitute any defense to a criminal charge (HKBA, 2014). Simply speaking, civil disobedience portrayed as a noble action taken by citizens. For the disobedient citizens, they believe that acting against the law of the society is the necessary means to keep the society as right as possible. Nonetheless, the civil disobedience participants must be ready to bear the legal responsibilities under the essence of law, and shoulder the consequences of their disobedient acts of fighting for common good and purposes in the society.

2.3. Citizenship in Liberal Studies

By its initial motive, Liberal Studies has been introduced into the New Secondary School Curriculum basically for two main objectives – firstly, to enhance the students’ understanding of themselves, their society, their country, the human world and the physical environment; secondly, to build up students’ positive values and outlook on life, so as to nurture them into well-informed and responsible citizens in different scales – the society, the state and the world (CDC&HKEAA, 2007). This indicates that Hong Kong society, China, and the global world are always the focuses of teaching and learning in Liberal Studies.

Areas of Study	Independent Enquiry Study (IES)
Self & Personal Development <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Module 1: Personal Development & Interpersonal Relationships 	Students are required to conduct an IES making use of the knowledge and perspectives gained from the three Areas of Study and extending them to new issues or contexts. To help students develop their IES titles, the following themes are suggested: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Media Education Religion Sports Art Information and Communication Technology (ICT)
Society & Culture <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Module 2: Hong Kong Today Module 3: Modern China Module 4: Globalization 	
Science, Technology & the Environment <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Module 5: Public Health Module 6: Energy Technology & the Environment 	

Table 1: Curriculum Framework for Liberal Studies (CDC&HKEAA, 2007)

The above table explicitly shows that the six modules are the focus of learning in the framework of Liberal Studies. Amongst them, Module Two (Hong Kong Today) consists of three themes, with one of them being “rule of law and socio-political participation”. Under this theme, we could look into the key enquiry question about “how Hong Kong residents participate in political and social affairs and come to grips with rights and responsibilities with respect to the rule of law” (CDC & HKEAA, 2007), together with loads of sub-questions which are also closely related to socio-political participation, rights and responsibilities, rule of law, and so on. This indicates that at least one third of the contents in the Module Two of Liberal Studies incorporate is closely related to the conception of citizenship.

Additionally, Liberal Studies Curriculum and Assessment Resource Package published in 2013 further elaborates and interprets the curriculum of Liberal Studies. It mentions three forms of identities: local identity, national identity, and identity as global citizens. And the focus is put on how local identity and the sense of national identity are affected by cultures and different events; while the focus of identity as global citizens is on how Hong Kong residents understand and demonstrate this identity (Hong Kong Education Bureau & HKEAA, 2013). According to this package, the exact term ‘citizenship’ is mentioned once, while lots of correlated concepts are still highlighted, such as socio-political participation, roles, identities, civil society, civilization, rights and responsibilities.

Chapter Three

Research Methodology

Research methodology refers to a set of chosen tools for unlocking the knowledge behind the riddles and finding the possible answers responding to the questions of interest. In this chapter, the research questions will be first outlined. Then the research design will be given next, followed by research methods data collection. And finally the procedure of data collection and justification will be illustrated.

3.1. Research Questions

The central question for this research is:

How does Umbrella Movement affect the learning of citizenship among students of Liberal Studies at senior secondary school level?

The study will also investigate the following questions:

- (1) How do students understand the concept of citizenship from Liberal Studies curriculum?
- (2) What pressures did students experience when making their decision – direct participation, indirect participation, or non-participation, in response to the Umbrella Movement?
- (3) What conflicts concerning the learning of citizenship did students experience or observe in the Umbrella Movement?
- (4) How do students learn about citizenship from the Umbrella Movement, as on-site

participants, off-site participants, or observers?

The main question is structured on the citizenship learning among senior secondary students and how this concept changes and develops during the Umbrella Movement. The research is carried out at a time after the official end of the Umbrella Movement when Hong Kong political reform is still a subject of ongoing public debate and heated controversy.

3.2 The Rationales of Using Qualitative Approach

A qualitative approach is employed in this research to answer a series of research questions derived from the key question - “How does Umbrella Movement affect the learning of citizenship among students of Liberal Studies at senior secondary school level?” As mentioned in the chapter one, the goal of this dissertation is to understand the essence of “citizenship” as expressed, perceived, experienced and developed by senior students of secondary schools.

All interviews are divided into two parts. In the first part, photo cues are provided to elicit the understanding of citizenship and the most salient episode of umbrella movement. In other words, the research began the interviews by asking students to show the photo they had chosen in advance, which is the most impressive and related to citizenship in the Umbrella Movement.

As for the second part, semi-structured and in-depth interviews are conducted for collecting data on different individuals’ personal experiences on studying citizenship under the curriculum of Liberal Studies, and their perspectives in seeing how the

Umbrella Movement influence, change or even bring about conflicts to their understanding of citizenship in Hong Kong context. Follow-up questions will be asked when it is necessary for further clarification.

3.2.1. Photo Cues

Participants are requested to prepare one photo related to ‘citizenship’ in the context of Umbrella Movement to tell the researcher why this photo could reflect ‘citizenship.’ Two students prepared the photos and saved them into their smart phones; while four of them had to borrow the Ipad of the researcher so that they could immediately search for those photos on the Internet. It took around three minutes.

The use of visual image acts as a way to recall students’ memories towards the context of Umbrella Movement, and helps them reconstruct the whole ‘story’ of what was happening during those seventy nine days and nights. Most importantly, photo cues are conducive to enhance the personal ownership of students’ learning of citizenship.

Two questions were set for this part:

- ♦ Why do you choose this photo?
- ♦ How can it reflect ‘citizenship’ in your eyes?

3.2.2. Interview Questions

In the second part of interviews, eight interview questions were distributed to the six participants in the research in advance to the interview. By way of semi-structure and in-depth interview, students are able to structure, organize and reconstruct different episodes of their experience concerning the Umbrella Movement. Additionally, students will be encouraged to express their reflexive understanding of citizenship, how Liberal Studies contribute to its learning, and the personal meaning of citizenship as individuals.

During the interviews, students were allowed to freely express their experiences related to “citizenship” in Liberal Studies classroom and during the course of Umbrella Movement. Also, follow-up questions were allowed to be asked by the researcher in order to elicit more spontaneous feelings, thoughts, and responses from the interviewees. Based on the sharing from their personal perspective, the researcher may give responses. The following outlines eight major questions, divided into three sections:

A. Conceptual Understanding of Citizenship in Liberal Studies Classroom:

1. What is citizenship? How do you understand the learning of citizenship in Liberal Studies classroom?
2. To what extent do you find textbooks and/or curriculum materials helpful for the learning of citizenship?

B. Students' Understanding of Citizenship in the Umbrella Movement:

3. What kind of role would you say you were playing in the Umbrella Movement? (i.e.

direct participation, indirect participation, non-participation or any others?)

- What lead to your decision?

- What pressure did you face?

4. What personal feelings or experiences of the movement could you share?

5. What major behaviors related to actualization of ‘citizenship’ among young students did you observe in the Umbrella Movement?

6. What insights about citizenship emerge from your observation or personal experiences?

7. What kinds of conflicts concerning the understanding of citizenship did you experience or observe in the Umbrella Movement?

C. Others:

8. On the subjects of Liberal Studies, Umbrella Movement and citizenship, do you have anything to add?

3.3. Data Collection and Justification

3.3.1. Selection of Participants

There are mainly two criteria in the selection of target participants. First, they are current students of Liberal Studies; and second, they have basic knowledge of Umbrella Movement.

Therefore, in the research, participants are six senior students (S4 – S6), who are comparable samples in terms of their readiness to engage in deep thinking about the significance of citizenship while studying the subject of Liberal Studies – two

students who support and actively participated into the movement; two students who support the movement but never show up in any occupied sites; and two students who do not support and participated into the movement. The sampling takes place within and beyond the sites of protests to identify participants and non-participants.

National identity is not taken into consideration in the selection of participants in order to find out more shared similarities and distinct difference on the understanding of citizenship among students. Totally, there are three males and three females who participated into this research. Among those interviewed students, two of them are new immigrants coming from the Mainland China, and have been living in Hong Kong for several years. The remaining four students are born and brought up in Hong Kong.

3.3.2. The Process of Data Collection

The data-collection process is based on visual images and interviews. Invitation for interviews began in November 2014, and interviews were all conducted from March to April 2015. There were six individual interviews in total. The interviews can be conducted in Cantonese, Mandarin, or English. During interviews, all of the informants answered the interview questions in Cantonese while sometimes English vocabularies were used. Each interview lasted for around 30 to 45 minutes, to be conducted in somewhere the interviewees feel comfortable and safe. The chosen places for interviews are respectively a private corner in public library and the open areas of universities.

In this research dissertation, Amy, Bonny, Cathy, David, Eason and Fraud are not the true names of interviewees A, B, C, D, E, and F for protecting respondents' confidentiality. These names will be used all along the dissertation to represent interviewees A, B, C, D, E, and F so that readers can make connection with them more easily and vividly.

Chapter Four

Research Findings and Data Analysis

Data revisit and data analysis took place almost concurrently. In this chapter, the data collected from the six interviewees will be re-organized and converted into useful information and valuable knowledge (Bala, 2005). The interview accounts and profiles (Appendix 1 and 2) based on the transcriptions of the interviews will also serve as the major source for analyzing the data. In recreating the interview accounts by listening to the recorded personal voices of six informants repeatedly, my task is to carefully reorganize their responses and reflections into a precise and concise version, and simplify their language to depict feelings and reflections on the subjects of Liberal Studies, Umbrella Movement, and most importantly, citizenship. This chapter endeavors to address all four sub-questions of the research by analyzing the data collected.

4.1. Conceptual Understanding of Citizenship

This finding may serve to answer the first sub-question listed in this research – *(1) how do students understand the concept of citizenship from Liberal Studies curriculum?*

4.1.1. Similarity of Understanding Citizenship

Shared understanding of citizenship can be found among six respondents. Students basically possess quite similar understanding of citizenship, and perhaps this common understanding can ascribe to the implementation of Liberal Studies from

which rights and responsibilities are always the most highlighting part in the Module Two of the textbook.

The term “citizenship” is closely related to “citizens,” from which rights and responsibilities can be associated with them. It is a relationship between the state and the people. (Fraud, Question 1)

Six interviewees shared quite similar understanding and general knowledge of citizenship. All of them emphasize rights and responsibilities in response to their identities. In Fraud’s quote above, he further explained that citizenship is the relationship between citizens and the state. But when interviewees were asked for more clarification of what rights and responsibilities refer to, all of them could illustrate them by giving examples, while some of them accurately referred them to political rights and social responsibilities.

Another interesting finding is that all respondents agreed that Liberal Studies is useful for them to understand the concept of citizenship better, although some claimed that this subject only helps a bit, while some pointed out that the term of citizenship is seldom mentioned by teachers in Liberal Studies classrooms, and not often seen in their textbooks.

4.1.2. Consistency of Understanding Citizenship between Students and Scholars

Looking deeper into different interpretations of “citizenship” among students, it can be found that students with different levels of participation of Umbrella Movement perceive the behaviors related to citizenship so differently. Some

responses of students are shown below:

People participated into Umbrella Movement because they think it is a critical moment for Hong Kong to get out from being erased in the history – everything is being controlled by Beijing government, and we are losing our freedom gradually. Citizenship is about sacrificing something you possess, such as time and promising career, especially once you are arrested, for bettering the society. (Amy, Question 3)

At first, I knew nobody in the occupied site. Then, it took a short time for me to start to talk with others and even get along with them. Maybe it is because we shared the same belief. It is a cool relationship. Some people describe it as neighborhood. We help one another although we even don't know their names. We cleaned up the rubbish nearby even though we didn't produce them. It's just because we want to make this little community more livable so that we can tolerate and fight for longer time. It is what I believe "citizenship", about helping each other, about building a friendly and helpful relationship with everyone living here. (Bonny, Question 4)

I would say citizenship is more than doing something good to a city or society. Because something you think it is good may not be really good in some people's eyes. That's why citizenship is about responsibility of respecting others – at least try not to insulting and offending others. A civil society must allow different opinions to be present, and I think it is good for the development... I really dislike some acts of protestors. They said foul language to the policemen and those who opposed the occupation, so-called

the group of blue-ribbon supporters. (Fraud, Question 7)

Obviously, the idea of citizenship as participation, suggested by Marshall and Bottomore (1992), is supported by Amy's and Bonny's quotes above.

Besides, these quotes shed light on the fact that students have different levels of understanding on "citizenship." Not surprisingly, students who directly participated into Umbrella Movement are more tended to perceive their participation as one of the best ways to demonstrate the good qualities of citizens and achieve a fairer community.

One should also note that all students did not mention the term "participation" and "identities" in the first interview question. It seems that students do not immediately relate the concept of citizenship to participations and identities when they are asked to share what citizenship means in their eyes. By contrast, as stated in chapter one, Delanty points out four core elements under the umbrella term of citizenship. Although all students only mention rights and responsibilities at the beginning of the interview, it does not show contradiction between Delanty's and students' interpretation of citizenship, because as a matter of fact, students are more willing and frequent to relate citizenship to participation as well as identity when the interviews continued, especially if the interview questions are within the context of Umbrella Movement.

4.1.3. Interrelation among Rights, Responsibilities, Participation and Identities

Interviewee Items of Citizenship	Amy	Bonny	Cathy	David	Eason	Fraud
Perception of Rights	Equal political rights	Equal right of being nominated and elected	Right of pursuing dream and a better society	Mentioned in the interview but not specified	Mentioned in the interview but not specified	Right and responsibilities are mutually affected
Perception of Responsibilities	Social responsibilities i.e. protest when injustice is exposed in the society	Political responsibilities e.g. voting Responsibilities of pursuing social justice e.g. protest	Mentioned in the interview but not specified	Mentioned in the interview but not specified	Responsibilities of not disturbing others when pursuing a better society	Right and responsibilities are mutually affected
Perception of Participations	Social movement e.g. Umbrella Movement	Social movement	Social movement	Social movement	Not mentioned in the interview	Social movement Studying Volunteerism
Perception of Identities	In conflict – A Hongkonger who loves HK v.s. loves both HK and China	Hongkonger	Hongkonger Hong Kong student	In conflict – student v.s. responsible citizen	Chinese	Hong Kong student

Table 2: The Perceptions of Students on the Four Attributes of Citizenship within the Context of Umbrella Movement

The above table is constructed on the idea of Delanty (2007) and the data collected from students in the interviews. According to Delanty, perception of rights, responsibilities, participations and identities are the essence of citizenship. In this research, interviewees have different interpretations for these four attributes. Their meaning perceived by students within the context of Umbrella Movement and their responses to the interview questions are re-interpreted, reorganized and restructured by the researcher and put into the table.

It is well-known that rights and responsibilities are interrelated with each other. But it is also found in this research that rights, responsibilities, participation and identities are independent attributes in citizenship, but actually they are closely intertwined with one another for developing citizenship in students.

For example, David struggled if he should meet his duty as a student by studying hard and preparing well for the upcoming public exam, or fulfill the social responsibilities as a Hong Kong citizen. He was stuck in the middle of two types of responsibilities which are weighed very heavily in his life. This struggle finally affects his identity how he perceives. He thought he is not a responsible citizen because when his city was faced with crisis, he did not show up to give support and help. The struggle between responsibilities undermines his identity as a responsible Hong Kong citizen to certain extent.

Another example is that interviewees have a preference to actualize the responsibilities by participation. For example, Amy and Bonny mentioned social responsibilities of achieving a more just society in the interviews. And later, they referred the participation to the participation into social affairs such as social

movement as the way to pursue social justice and demonstrate citizenship. In comparison with Eason, he focused on the responsibilities of not bringing inconvenience to other people, and later in the interview, he did not mention anything related to participation.

On one thing, this is because Eason has a clear stance as an opponent against the Umbrella Movement, and that is why he thinks the protestors are responsible for the severe traffic jam and inconvenience caused. For another thing, as responsibilities and participation are suggested to be closely interrelated, it is very likely that when Eason did not participate into the Umbrella Movement, he also never participated into any social movement ever before. It is no wonder that Eason did not come up with the ideas that responsibilities can be seen as social responsibilities in the interview because he never had such experience of participating into any social movement. Therefore, it is suggested that rights, responsibilities, participation and identities react upon one another under the conception of citizenship.

4.2. Pressure upon Different Responsibilities and Identities

I have no idea if I made a good decision. Maybe I made a good job of being a responsible student who didn't skip lessons and studied hard. But not a responsible citizen. (David, Question 7)

My parent would have been worried me very much if I had gone out to participate into the movement like other students did. (Cathy, Question 3)

The pressure of making the decision of participating into the movement or not, and the way to participate, partially originates from the expectation of the others. This part is particularly directed at another sub-question of the research: *(2) what pressures did student experience when making their decision – direct participation, indirect participation, or non-participation?*

As mentioned by Cathy, parents were worried about their children's participation of the Umbrella Movement. Understandably, students are not free to make any decision they like, because they are still 'immature' in the eyes of adults and that is the reason why their parents have a big desire to protect them when it comes to potential dangers their children might face.

From the quote of David, the meaning of a responsible citizen is controversial. Actually, being a responsible citizen is also one of the top objectives in the Liberal Studies curriculum. Students are not only responsible for their learning in school, but also learning how to participate into the society and various social affairs. Students have to justify their decision by some good reasons. Students struggled a lot because they encounter pressure from others – the expectation of parent on their academic performance, the social expectation upon the young generation, the peer expectation for supporting each other in the occupied sites, and many others. The process of self-justifying their own decisions and their reasoning actually reflects the learning of citizenship because they have to weight different roles assigned to them and make the most responsible decision for their lives.

The identity is another complicated subject especially for students because they experience somethings fresh new every day in their lives, which influence the construction and development of their identities. This conflict about responsibilities and identities perceived by students will be further discussed in the chapter five.

4.3. Conflicts in Citizenship

This session attempts to address the third sub-question – (3) *what conflicts concerning the learning of citizenship did students experience or observe in the Umbrella Moment?*

4.3.1. Conflicts between civil society and civil disobedience

The conflict I perceive is that, the rule of law has been established and planted in Hong Kong such a civil society for long; while Umbrella Movement is popularly considered as civil disobedience threatening the maintenance of legal systems. Also, civil disobedience is one possible and powerful direction of civil rights movement; while the significance for rule of law is also emphasized in a civil society. (Bonny, Question 7)

My dad was one of those affected persons of the movement because he is a driver. The protestors should learn to respect the rights and freedom of other Honghongers, who hold different views on their disobedient acts. They should resort to more civilized means to express their voice and persuade others to support their action. (Fraud, Question 4)

Seemingly students encounter conflict and confusion for understanding a statement that these two conceptions can co-exist with each other. Stated in the chapter two, in accordance with Rawls, civil disobedience plays a role in preserving just institutions. Thomassen (2007) describes civil disobedience as ‘being suspended between legality and legitimacy’. The further clarification of this depiction is that civil disobedience relies on the essence of legality, within the frame of rule of law, but against it owing to a lack of legitimacy.

Echoing with the literature review, a honorable history and success related to civil disobedience can be seen in some countries such as India, South Africa, the U.S.A., and so. It is based on conscientious grounds, and to resist injustice derived from a lack in the legitimacy in the law, but not a way of threatening the government or the authority, but

However, as pointed out by Fraud, civil disobedience is not only a matter affecting the law-breaking protestors, but also other citizens, such as the road users and people living or working near to the occupied sites. From the news during the seventy-nine days of occupation, it was seen and reported that numerous Hongkongers were afflicted with severe traffic congestion; parents were worrying their children since they could not attend school; employees had to wake up much earlier in order not to be late to work and spend much more time for commuting every day because of road closure; residents nearby the occupied sites were annoyed by the noise made by protestors every night.

Nonetheless, no one can deny that most participants were behaving nonviolently and peacefully. In the Umbrella Movement, on one hand, the protestors behaved with a sense of proportion, never caused excessive damage, and minimized the inconvenience made. Many people are impressed by their sincerity of pursuing the social justice they believe, without being fearful of the penalties imposed by the law afterwards. Their behavior also demonstrated civic spirit. On another hand, the police and prosecutors behaved professionally, at least no one died in the movement, which was viewed as revolution and uprising by some people. The restraint and patience of the policemen also demonstrated the spirit of rule of law. Moreover, when the court issued injunction, most protesters were willing to obey to the decision because it was made by the independent judiciary. And even up to the present, the courts consider the conscientious motives of the protesters before imposing sentences. This shows the mercy of legislation in a civil society. All little parts mentioned above in the Umbrella Movement pictures out the whole of a highly civil image.

Even though citizens, who broke the law against the unjust law or government action, were punished by law and criticized by people, sometimes they were vindicated by history after some years. Perhaps, this marks the existence of justice and diversity in a civilized community with high capacity to accommodate different voices, and different forms of protests.

In a healthy civil society, diversity of voice is essential. People take up their own roles to make the society better, by different means and focusing on different facets. The conflicts can be understood in this way: the law-breakers, the law-enforcers, and the law-interpreter all co-exist in one society. However, their roles do play important parts in a civil society for counterbalancing one another's power. Without a doubt, a

society cannot grow to be maturely civil enough if it is in lack of either one of these parties. Therefore, the conflict we perceived as contradiction and tension in the Umbrella Movement is actually the resolution to the conflict itself.

4.3.2. Conflicts between citizenship at a city's level and national level

To me, citizenship is more relevant to a city, instead of nation, although they are correlated. Or else, it won't be named as 'citizenship', but 'patriotism'. I think citizenship is beyond the country's interest, but putting the public good of a city or the community as the top of the agenda. Therefore, I don't think we have to care much about how Chinese government views the Umbrella Movement..... When I reflect on the movement now, maybe I was wrong. I don't know. Perhaps I really love my country and my city, but it is not communist party. (Amy, Question 7)

Amy holds a belief that the nature of "citizenship" should be based on the local pursuits. At the time of her interview, the identity of "Hongkongers" and the scale of "city" were emphasized, for example, "Hong Kong citizens should save their city by themselves."

Her response strongly arouses two more controversies, namely – the struggles of different identities perceived among students, and different interpretations of citizenship between the city's scale and the national scale. These two interesting findings will also be deeply discussed in the chapter five.

To sum up in this session, although many conflicts, spotted out during the Umbrella Movement, present inherent tension and contradictions among citizens, it is hoped that students could take them as valuable chances to explore more diverse or even hostile voice in society, and learn to be reflexive – bending back on cause and effects the conflicts, so as to reconcile these contradictions.

4.4. Citizenship and Umbrella Movement

In the research, all respondents agreed that there are some positive impacts of the Umbrella Movement on their development of citizenship. Therefore, this session endeavors to answer the last sub-question of the research – (4) *what do students learn about citizenship from Umbrella Movement, as on-site participants, off-site participants, or observers?*

4.4.1. Different Participation Levels and Degrees of Students

Interviewee Participation Levels and Degrees	Amy	Bonny	Cathy	David	Eason	Fraud
Direct Participation	✓	✓				
Indirect Participation			✓	✓		
Active Participation	✓	✓	✓			
Passive Participation				✓		
Non- participation					✓	✓
On-site Observation						✓

Table 3: The Participation Levels and Degrees of Students in the Umbrella Movement

The above table is constructed to actualize different participation levels and participation degrees varying from students to students in a much easier way, based on the data collected from the interviews. Explanations are given in the following:

For direct participation, Amy participated into the movement since the class boycott on 26th September, and she continued to support the movement by spending lots of time in the occupied sites, especially in the early stage of the movement. As for active participation, Amy initiated and led a concern group in her school in order to ask for support from other students, and arouse the attention of parents and teachers; and she mostly committed herself into helping protesters in the occupied site of Mongkok.

For direct participation, Bonny participated into the movement almost every weekend and holiday, mainly staying in the occupied site of Admiralty; and she slept overnight inside the tents provided in the occupied site in Admiralty. As for active participation, Bonny contributed to the movement by taking up and trying different roles in different occupied sites. She once helped first-aid work to transport salty water and clean up the streets in Admiralty; helped distribute snacks and drinks in Causeway Bay; and slept overnight to show support to Mongkok protestors.

For indirect participation, Cathy has never participated into the movement, but she supports it. As for active participation, Cathy actively discussed and shared the news related to UM with friends and relatives, and on different social medias, particularly on facebook; as well as help making and distributing yellow ribbons in school.

For indirect participation, Eason has never participated into the movement, but he supports it. As for passive participation, David passively involved and participated into the movement because he simply wears yellow ribbons on his school uniforms and T-shirt every day.

For non-participation, Eason has never participated into the movement, and he opposes it because he thinks the movement created lots of chaos with aims of overthrowing the current authority.

For non-participation and on-site observation, Fraud is curious of knowing why many young people participated into the movement, and that's why he chose to visit the occupied site situated in Admiralty for one time. Although Fraud visited the occupied sites once, it does not mean that he participated into it because he opposes the movement.

4.4.2. Learning of Citizenship as Participation

Protestors spontaneously cleaned up the occupied roads and streets regularly. They also organized trash classification and recycling every morning. Study spaces were created by carpenters for the studying purpose of participating students. The most interesting part is the public bathrooms opposite to the LegCo were provided with skin-care products. At the very beginning of the UM, some protesters treated the protest as a party by eating hotpot and even playing ping-pong. However, these kinds of disrespectful behavior were soon stopped by others because the objective of the movement is not entertaining but protesting against the government. At the later stages of the

movement, protesters also showed love and care for local communities by chitchatting with local residents, and support the local small businesses near to the occupied sites. (Bonny, Question 5)

In spite of the fact that some radical protesters attempted to escalate the movement, most of the rest tried their every endeavor to maintain peace and order in the occupied sites for fear that the protest would become violent. For example, on 1st October, which is the National Day, protesters use their bodies to block radicals from interrupting the Flag-raising Ceremony. Another example is that after masked protesters stormed into the LegCo, student leaders such as Joshua Wong publicly criticized the act as “irresponsible,” and highlight the peaceful and non-violent manner of the Umbrella Movement. (David, Question 5)

The dialogue between student leaders and the Hong Kong highest government officials on 21st October was conducted in a very good civil manner. All of them know how to respect others, although they did not agree with the viewpoint of each other. By that time, many protestors were watching the live show in the occupied sites. Although I was not one of them, I still felt so unforgettable via watching the TV. (Cathy, Question 5)

Umbrella Movement turned out to be a political failure, but its spirit is never dead. Our efforts in the participation won't go in vain. Our spirit will continue and spread out to others and the next generation... (Researcher: what is this spirit about?)

It is about pursuing social and civil rights, and public interest, without fear.

(Amy, Question 8)

Echoing with Sartori's idea of citizenship as participation mentioned in the chapter two, participation can be considered as an essential condition for exercising the power of citizens (Sartori, 1987). Through direct and indirect participation, citizens express their dissatisfaction in hopes of making their demands heard by the government and the larger public. In this research, different levels of participation are defined in the glossary in chapter one, and the participation levels and degrees are further identified in the Table 3. For Bonny, she is identified as the direct and active participant, while Cathy, the indirect and active participant, and David, the indirect and passive participant.

From the above quotes, one should note that Bonny who directly participated into the movement, is more able to describe what was happening in the movement in details and vividly, based on her firsthand experience because she actually went into the occupied sites of Admiralty in person, 'lived' in that small community, and found connection with other protestors.

Additionally, Cathy and David, albeit indirectly participating into the movement by getting in touch with the most up-to-date information and news sharing on different social medias, their learning of citizenship in the Umbrella Movement should not be neglected. Cathy observes that in the seventy-nine days, protesters co-created communal spaces of good order and high civility in the occupied sites. She got this perception, partially due to the mass media and discussion with those who had directly participated. The formation of ‘little community’ in different occupied sites impressed her a lot.

As for David, he said he partially supported the Umbrella Movement because he is not in line with some behaviors of the radical protestors. In retrospect, the most unforgettable moment for him was that some students formed a human chain to stop radicals from storming the Flag-raising Ceremony. He believes that this act would irritate the Chinese government and eventually tragedies might take place. He grasped the meaning of citizenship as interpreted as pursuing public good and looking into the whole picture. From his sharing, it can be seen that citizenship is not about destroying relationship, but constructing or reconstructing it.

The above students’ responses reveal that the Umbrella Movement is successful of cultivating active citizenship among the on-site and off-site participants. Although students who support the Umbrella Movement vary in their participation levels and degrees, the learning of citizenship is still affirmed by reading the above quotes of the students. Both direct and indirect participation are not only conducive to students’ learning of citizenship, but also for building a healthy civil society.

4.4.3. Learning of Citizenship in Non-participation

I can't understand the reasons why some Hong Kong teenagers are so unwilling or even resistant to see their identities as being a Chinese. I know China is not always doing a good job in many aspects, such as food safety, human rights, environmental protection, etc., but it doesn't mean that we have to hate our motherland, because if so, we are actually putting our hatred toward Hong Kong which is definitely inseparable part of China. We can make a change in our city and country by many other means except from uprisings and revolution. (Interview E, Question 4)

At first, my impression of those protestors was very negative. They blocked the roads. Their action turned the city into chaos and caused much inconvenience to others. To my parent, the occupation seemed to drag Hong Kong into anarchy, leaderless and lawless. However, some protestors, to my surprise, were willing to withdraw from some occupied streets where the injunction was issued and in effect by the court, although not all protestors did respect it. Then I started to question – why they, on one hand violate the rule of law, but on the another hand, respect the court decision? Although at the end of the day I still do not agree with what they are claiming that the existing order is not justice, a short-term chaos can bring about long-term order and justice, so forth and so on, at least I know a bit more about their stance. (Fraud, Question 6)

Fraud underwent a process of reflective thinking while he was reading and feeling confused about the news reporting that some protestors who broke the rule of law and occupied the streets started to withdraw from the places with the injunction's legal effect. This respect to the law surprised Eason and made him desire to know more about the opposite side – the reasons behind the protestors for participating into the occupation movement. He was trying to seek the 'truth', and even though he did not change his stance of opposing the Umbrella Movement, his attempt for putting himself into the shoe of the opposite party, undoubtedly facilitates his learning of 'citizenship,' and opens up his heart of embracing different voice in the society.

Fraud also learns the importance of reaching out to different people. It is important not only for convincing others, but more importantly, for understanding others. No matter what people are – the locals or the mainlanders, supporters for or opponents against the Umbrella Movement, are still worthy of reaching out to them, because these people are strangers to us, but connecting with our daily lives – parents, relatives, and neighbors in the community.

Put shortly, from the case of Fraud, even though he strongly opposes to the movement, he still has a willing heart opened up to other opinions. He once went to the occupied site in Admiralty for knowing more about the rationale behind the movement, and why so many students supporting it. It is therefore very important for people – no matter supporters or opponents, to narrow the gap with an open heart filled with respect and generosity, because the more truth is debated, the clearer it becomes. It is never an easy task, though. It may not result in an immediate reconciliation, but a step closer to the truth.

It is not surprising to know that students who hold a supporting stance toward the Umbrella Movement have a more in-depth and positive reflection. But meanwhile, students who oppose to the Umbrella Movement also reflect on it at a deep level. Fraud pointed out the gap between two camps – yellow ribbon (supporting the Umbrella Movement and occupation) and blue ribbon (supporting the policemen to maintain social order) can by no means be neglected. The respect for and acceptance of diverse opinions, political stances, social tolerance, or even individual ways of living might not solve the contemporary social and political problems rooted in Hong Kong for so many years, but at least on the right track to narrow, or simply avoid widening the gap between citizens of two camps.

These quotes show that even for the non-participation students, who acted as observers in the Umbrella Movement, to certain extents, the movement still raises their civic awareness of problems the city has been facing, and the importance of understanding diverse voices in a society. This also paves the way to a more mature civil society.

Chapter Five

Discussion

This research attempts to explore how students experience, and understand the conception of “citizenship” as stimulated by the Umbrella Movement in Hong Kong. In this chapter, the main research question will be revisited for more in-depth discussion.

Main research question:

How does Umbrella Movement affect the learning of citizenship among students of Liberal Studies at senior secondary school level?

From the findings presented in the chapter four, the positive impact of Umbrella Movement on raising the civic consciousness and knowledge among Hong Kong young generations are the undoubted fact.

5.1. Identities of Student as Citizens

It is worthy of discussion that whether citizenship should be understood and interpreted as city level (Hong Kong), national level (China), or global level (world governance), as echoed to the findings in the previous chapter. Although all interviewees highlight the sense of belonging as an important theme under citizenship, some refer it to Hong Kong while some others associate with China. This explains that the difference between local identity and national identity when it comes to citizenship.

Amy and Bonny, who support and directly participated into the Umbrella Movement, tend to relate citizenship to a membership of Hong Kong. They see themselves as students, who are the social pillar of Hong Kong in the future, and that is why they must shoulder this “responsibilities” of “saying no to the social and political injustice”. Also, they consider themselves as Hong Kong citizens. Therefore, they fearlessly participated into the UM.

Meanwhile, Eason and Fraud, who oppose to the Umbrella Movement prefer to associate citizenship with a membership of China. They see themselves as Chinese, who should put social stability of the state as the first priority among many different sets of rights and responsibilities. But meanwhile, they do not forget the city where they are living – Hong Kong, and they attempted to depict their identity in a more accurate way that they are Hong Kong Chinese or Chinese Hongkongers.

Actually, whilst participants in the Umbrella Movement emphasize their identity as “Hongkongers”, they also advocate more democratic and fairer society that stresses on community development. They are actually pursuing a better society in Hong Kong, rather than a better country. That may be the reason why in the occupied sites, protestors spontaneously co-create an ideal “little community” with good facilities such as self-study areas, libraries, bathroom, areas public speech and so on.

This view of citizenship in relation to identity varies so differently due to the difference of cultural and national backgrounds, social discourses, and personal and collective experiences (Tajfel & Turner, 1986). It should be noted that the cultural and national background of Amy, Bonny, Cathy and David are strongly different from Eason and Fraud. The former are locally-born in Hong Kong; while the latter are new

immigrant born in China and have been living in Hong Kong for few years.

All respondents who provide valuable responses and data for this research were in adolescence, at the ages between fifteen years old to eighteen years old. They reach to crucial stage of establishing their identity. For students at this age, when they are pursuing senior secondary education, particularly in the subject of Liberal Studies which empowers them with critical thinking and sets of practical skills for developing knowledge and understanding the society as well as the world, meanwhile they are also preparing themselves for becoming responsible adults, and more importantly, to develop, confirm and refine their identity and character, so as to contemplate their role in society.

5.2. Making Sense of Reality

5.2.1. The Reality Hurts

Every action has its outcome. Students must face success or failure in their efforts to achieve what they desire. Without achieving anything, students who participated into the Umbrella Movement, became disengaged; while some others even felt disempowered because they are not capable of influencing the policies, as inconsistent with the discourse of actualizing citizenship.

Amy is typically one of the disappointed. After the Umbrella Movement, she tried hard to seek alternative meanings and ways to actualize her aspirations. She shared at the end of the interview that she was going to study abroad, about the subject of IR (i.e. International Relations). When asked if she would participate into

any follow-up movements afterwards, maybe in May or June of 2015, she replied by 'not sure'. She used to be a very active participant half a year ago, but now, it seems she loses her passion or I might say, the determination of making a change in our society, where she believed it is an unjust one.

Researcher: Then you won't participate anymore?

Amy: Participate what?

Researcher: Maybe the second Occupation, or other civil rights movements?

Amy: I don't know. I only know our participation in the Umbrella Movement didn't change anything. Of course, I will still participate, to fulfill my responsibilities as a citizen, to vote and to serve, which are more useful means to contribute to the society. After all, I will study abroad, the IR (International Relations). So I will be unable to spend much time on participating into local affairs.

From the above quotes, it is noted that even the direct and active participant, after the end of the Umbrella Movement, feels discouraged by not being able to get what she wanted. She is not alone. It can be estimated that many participants also share the same feeling with Amy.

Participants, at the beginning of the movement, were passionate and determinate. They commit themselves to fight for the social wellbeing and public good. But after the movement, their passion fades away. Indeed, it does not mean that they are no

longer civic-aware of the current situations of Hong Kong. They just feel powerless, and want to pursue something more meaningful for their development of citizenship and the society.

The experience of an individual towards “reality” shapes the lens how he perceives himself as an empowered citizen or a passive dweller in a society. When citizenship comes to grips with reality, they start to look down their roles. They perceive themselves as powerless. If the participants are not successful in their efforts and trials to exercise influence in public affairs, they will feel upset, and consider if their actions are useful or not. Some may even turn to another extreme of citizenship level – becoming indifferent of politics and social movements. From the conversation between Amy and the researcher, seemingly Amy becomes less active in light of socio-political participation than before.

5.2.2. Another Side of the Reality

Sense-making is a cognitive process to entail citizens on giving meaning to the experience. Some active participants of Umbrella Movement considers themselves as losers in this experience because they could not even make a little change in the surroundings and influence the government policies. It is inconsistent with what they have known in the past and learnt in school – citizens as powerful subject in a society. To accomplish consistency with the “reality”, an individual has to bring congruence to his or her life by matching experience, understanding and awareness (Giddens, 1991). In this research, the “reality” and those experience, understanding and awareness are definitely referred to the citizenship in the context of Umbrella Movement

At first glance, the outcome of Umbrella Movement is a big defeat for all participants because both Chinese and Hong Kong government insist on their original stance that the candidates of the Chief Executive must be pre-screened by 1,200 members of the Nominating Committee as the precondition for the universal suffrage in 2017. In other words, the political exclusion still exists, and the Umbrella Movement is a failure from this perspective.

However, Umbrella Movement is neither a game nor a battle. No winners and losers can be accurately defined and clearly identified in this context. The collective empowerment of students in the Umbrella Movement can be realized by the collective civic experience that every participant and observer undertook the process of reflecting on their roles and identities positioned in the society. The young people of Hong Kong might fail to achieve what they originally want, but actually something else. They have surprised the general public, the international societies, and themselves, because of their courage, determination, unity, high mobility of manpower, self-discipline and most importantly, the civic spirit – no longer notorious of “spoilt queens and kings”, but willing to organize trash or even clean toilets, as a way to demonstrate the citizenship qualities to the public.

There is neither true winner nor loser in the reality. In the bygone days, Hong Kong young people were indifferent and seldom concerned about what is happening in the society, not to mention motivating them into actions. However, the outbreak of Umbrella Movement disclosed that our teenagers do not only care about the celebrities and academic performance in school, but also the future development of the whole community as well as democratic political reform. They co-create the

occupied sites in an innovative way, with some humorous slogans and interaction among different participants. They also reflect on how politics, law, and the city interrelate to each other. After the Umbrella Movement, Hong Kong students and youngsters are more willing and determined to take up more responsibilities on their shoulders, such as the controversies of land redevelopment, housing and income inequality, environmental issues, crowded living conditions, the difficulties faced by small business, and many. It is from this perspective that students achieved a lot in the movement – cultivating active citizenship in our city.

“That which does not kill us makes us stronger,” is a famous quote among young people recently. To make sense of the reality, students now relate their daily lives to the experience of Umbrella Movement and to establish congruence with “reality” at a personal level. Young people attach much more importance to the Hong Kong local specialties. For example, they concern about the fact that Hong Kong hawkers will die out very soon. For the fear that the urban development will finally push this traditional trade into extinction and make those hawkers not able to maintain a living, students create facebook page and ask for signature from people to support the survival of hawkers. And finally, the Financial Secretary John Tsang Chunwah recently disclosed his plan to introduce food truck in Hong Kong in order to preserve these local food specialties.

The young generations, albeit achieving nothing in the Umbrella Movement, are actually sustaining their “practices of citizenship” even though the Umbrella Movement is over. “Practices” are not necessarily related to “physical participation” while teenagers engage themselves into “meaningful participation” or “meaningful expression” for achieving a civil society which maintain social justice and equality.

These social participations re-direct the essence of citizenship in the Umbrella Movement to various corners of our society, without being unrestricted by a particular period of time and the physicality of protests.

5.3. Liberal Studies and Citizenship Education

The need for developing students as informed and responsible citizens is well recognized in the objectives of Liberal Studies as stated in the Chapter Two, as the need for understanding and cooperation is vitally important in a complicated society. The concept of citizenship as incorporated into Liberal Studies can be noted from two defining aspects: rights and responsibilities in order to achieve a better society and more advanced humanity.

5.3.1. Citizenship Education Built on Conflicts

A closer look reveals that Liberal Studies is effective to promote citizenship. Findings from the research show the success of Liberal Studies teaching right and responsibility among individual students, and also, the importance of identity building, different forms of participation in the society, as well as conflict management for a better understanding of citizenship.

While equipping students with a set of problem-solving skills is highlighted in the objective of Liberal Studies, there seems to be no big difference between solving a problem and managing a conflict. A key to citizenship for a just society is to develop the capacity of citizens to “nonviolently and equitably manage conflict” (Bickmore, 2005). In a society gradually divided into two camps – yellow ribbon and blue ribbon,

the values, personal belief, and choices, vary from students to students, and citizens to citizens. Therefore, a set of conflict management skills become much more important than ever before.

Despite of the constraints of Liberal Studies classroom, Hong Kong educators are responsible for teaching dynamic citizenship within the existing Liberal Studies curriculum. Liberal Studies classroom may become the only possible way for facilitating learning of citizenship. For example, instead of shying away from the identity-based conflicts in a classroom consisting of both local students and mainland Chinese immigrant students, teachers should surface the students' deeply conflicting interpretations of identity at different levels by holding class activities such as discussion. Although sometimes the discussion might get out of hand, it is still worth seeking out the difference among students so that they could embrace and accept it at an earlier age.

Clearly, students – as the citizens of today and tomorrow, are eager to gain capacity and likely to be empowered in democratic processes if opportunities are given to them in the classroom for practicing these processes, with guidance and feedback from their teachers. They can first get used to conflicts, and then gain more valuable experience about handling such conflict in a constructive way, as preparation for citizenship. As referred to the visual image chosen by Amy, citizenship is like a little plant. Every day it grows a bit, when more experience of handling conflicts is gained. These conflicts are numerous, ranging from the conflict among different social expectations to the identity-based conflict. Therefore, citizenship may not be difficult to learn, but surely take long time to understand it. Matters of conflict and fairness are interrelated to each other, so the knowledge, skills, and values acquired in

Liberal Studies classrooms are particularly crucial for building a more just and fairer society. To accomplish it, Liberal Studies can play a bigger role in providing students with opportunities to practice the ways to handle diverse opinions or even conflicting perspectives in the classroom, so as to respect the pluralist society and make sense of our complex world.

5.3.2. Construction of Global Citizenship

Researcher: Why choose IR?

Amy: To me, exploring more through the relation among different countries and international societies is the best way to know the world of today better. And, humorously speaking, it also echoes with the theme of today's interview – citizenship. Not only engage myself into the society or the city I am in, but also the globe I am interacting with.

Amy, throughout the interview, contemplated on exploring the concept of citizenship in different perspectives and relating it to her experience in the Umbrella Movement. Before the end of the interview, she shared her aspirations in the greater society, and study plan after a few years. Her active ways of participation in the Umbrella Movement, to some extent, molded a cornerstone in her pursuit of citizenship in a broader scale, as well as the development of “global citizenship” in the future.

The interaction between countries is getting more intense in the 21st century. Worldwide, students are encouraged to develop a sense of “citizenship without

boundaries”, for preparing themselves as global citizens of tomorrow, in face of severely unequal of wealth distribution, food crisis, terrorism, cross-cultural misunderstanding, and extreme weather, economic and political instability, and many other challenges.

As suggested by Hudson and Slaughter (2007) in the chapter two, citizenship is “moving along a continuum”. Affected by globalization, people start to reflect on the meaning of citizenship beyond locality. Stromquist (2009) claim that some people tend to use vague language to describe “citizenship” in the way like ‘human race are responsible for conditions of the Earth,’ and ‘all individual subjects – humankind, flora or fauna are all subject to moral law,’ ‘a world government should be promoted for sustaining peace and justice among all species in the planet.’ From these, we could see that the interaction between globalization and citizenship, which in turn, construct a new form of citizenship – global citizenship. This term is seldom mentioned in the Umbrella Movement, and never mentioned by any respondents of this research.

Global citizenship is associated with different moral concerns. Most students in the interview were impressed by the environmental-friendly behavior of the participants, for example, rubbish classification. The rationale behind their behavior starts from a heart caring for not only our city and country, but also for our planet. The small action – categorizing rubbish into plastics, paper, aluminum cans and glasses helps a lot for decomposition process, which is significant of minimizing the harmful effect on the atmosphere.

Globalization is one of the six modules embedded in the subject of Liberal Studies. It consists of one sixth of the total content of liberal studies. While Liberal

Studies often encourage students to think cross-modularly, the theme socio-political participation under the module two (Today Hong Kong) and module four (globalization) can also be reconstructed to form new knowledge – global citizenship. Referring to the Liberal Studies Curriculum and Assessment Resource Package (2013), teachers can choose to use international NGOs as the case studies which are more familiar to Hong Kong residents, for example, World Vision, Doctors Without Borders, Oxfam, Greepeace, etc., for the purpose of “introducing the rationale of global citizenship and its corresponding actions”. Hence, it is affirmed that participation in different affairs, both social and international, is still an important way of understanding citizenship, no matter from a local scale or global scale. From this perspective, Liberal Studies share some similar elements related to globalization, participation of international organizations which are in line with the subject of “global citizenship”.

5.4. Trust in Citizens and Confidence in Civil Society

Hong Kong has confronted the most tremendous socio-political crisis, almost resulting in uncontrollable chaos in 2014. People named crisis as “Umbrella Movement”. The crisis stems from the distrust of Hongkongers towards the Chinese government. Notwithstanding, the outbreak of Umbrella Movement and the end of it has never resolved the underlying problems.

In the Umbrella Movement, we could see that each party – yellow-ribbon camp and blue-ribbon camp are deliberately turning a deaf ear to the fact that the no camp can represent the absolute mainstream voice and opposite voices do exist in the society. Those who strongly oppose to the Umbrella Movement, including the Chinese

government, HKSAR government officials, the establishment parties, mainly focused on the negative consequences caused by the movement, for instance, public disturbances and violations against the rule of law. They even blamed protesters for being motivated by economic incentives without any evidence. Meanwhile, the protestors also focus too much on the imperfection of the political institutions. They refuse to be ruled by Chinese government and resist the political, cultural, and social influence of China. They fail to recognize the good and positive values of China. They simply throw their indignation at both Chinese and HKSAR government for excluding the general public in Hong Kong from having influence in public affairs as well as the right to choose the leaders they like, without deeply thinking in the perspective of the government, looking into the bigger picture about the long-term development and social stability in the entire country.

Consequently, the political gap between the citizens and those in power is getting wider and wider, so that even up to the present moment, no one could bridge this gap, because all parties and camps refuse to take a step backward, once again sitting on the negotiable table for more equal, rational, and constructive dialogues. Apparently, it is not just a gap between yellow-ribbons and blue-ribbons; or between the pan-democrats and the establishment parties – it is actually the gap between Chinese government and Hong Kong citizens, which inevitably undermines the development of a civil society.

Only trust can fill up those gaps. In a conflict situation, it is very difficult, if possible, to achieve any positive change. Any attempt to ease the situation often results in more conflicts to be created. Trust is the key to conflict resolution. It is understandable for the Chinese government to hold a belief that a fully-participatory

decision-making process in politics will certainly weaken the authority of government or even endanger national stability. But one should note that even the Chinese government is not an inhumane entity. Human factors are involved in every government, while trust is of paramount importance for every relationship among the humankind. Sometimes, particularly in a crisis situation, maybe instead of opposing the government, a civil society can endeavor and contribute to restore trust between different parties, especially between people and the government. At the same time, the government should also have trust in its citizens and learn to hear the voices of people. It is impossible for these civic-minded citizens to chastise the society where they are living in. It is only by enhanced communication and trust building, positive interaction between state and the people can be achieved.

Chapter Six

Conclusion

6.1. Summary

The term of citizenship entails citizens to actively take on a role involving and interacting with social and political acting, and sometimes this is not only an individual but also a collective role, related to public affairs and public good. Confronted by political exclusion, many citizens, in addition to giving a vote in elections, or participating into occasional protest, resort to an extra-institutional channel – civil disobedience. It is, to be more specific in Hong Kong context, the Umbrella Movement in late September 2014, to express the demands for pursuing a better election system.

The interview data collected in this research are fragments that contain different understanding of citizenship and short stories associated with the Umbrella Movement, revealing how students struggled a lot along the journey of participating or not participating into the movement. Students in the context of the Umbrella Movement, on one hand, can develop their understanding of citizenship, and on the another hand, look at their “selves” through the lens of peers, society and the world, so as to reconstruct their own identities as responsible and reflective citizens.

Socially, the the ideological gap between parties has been widening and split into two extremes in recent years. In this storm, the journey students have to navigate through in the course of developing self-identity definitely becomes much more complex than in a more homogenous social context in the past. It may be difficult, if

possible, for stubborn grown-ups to change their minds, but certainly it is much easier to cultivate the seed of positive values such as accountability, transparency, democracy and the rule of law at the early age of an individual. For this end, citizenship education perhaps can be seen as one possible resolution in the long run.

Citizenship education is not attached with much importance in Hong Kong, while moral and national education share some similar attributes but eventually aborted in recent years. Perhaps, the splitting society can urge every Hongkonger, especially those who are in power, to consider citizenship education as a tool for social cohesion. As suggested by Amy in the interview, citizenship perceived in her eyes can be portrayed as a little plant. It is so true that after absorbing enough water, sunray and nutrients in the soil, the plant will bud and gradually grow up to become a tree. Citizenship is an “ever-growing” concept, and the interpretation for it also changes from time to time.

Therefore, the “roots” of interpreting citizenship is vitally important. Citizenship education serves as an effective way to reinforce the foundation of the understanding of citizenship. This study gives credits to the subject of Liberal Studies for successfully equipping young generations with the basic understanding of citizenship, and meanwhile showing the limitations of Liberal Studies in light of “practicing citizenship” in the classroom. Liberal Studies is also seen as one of the keystones to further develop the sense of citizenship among students to the next level – beyond a city’s context and countries’ boundary.

For students, the learning of citizenship will continue after the end of Umbrella Movement. The understanding of citizenship is the prerequisite for individual citizens

to understand their social and political roles of in a position facing civil society and the state. Along the journey, students will encounter more and more conflicts from which they may feel frustrated. However, students will finally find the true meanings of “citizenship” through the ongoing process of experiencing and making sense of different “realities.”

For me, the course of conducting this research is definitely a self-critical inquiry journey to get into the true meaning of “citizenship” in a deeper level. The research process turns out to be an enriching experience, which inspires me of different understanding and interpretation towards the conception of citizenship. Expectedly, every individual involved in the Umbrella Movement has been navigating through the storms about the development of “citizenship” and establishment of “selves”, and one day they will be able to seek the truth behind the realities and conflicts.

6.2. Research Limitations

As only six students were invited to participate into this research, the selected sample size is relatively small, and thus the findings may become less convincing and accurate. Also, their experience in the Umbrella Movement may not be able to show the whole picture of the learning of citizenship because of the enormously large scale of the movement. More importantly, authenticity of participants is another issue worth of attention because Umbrella Movement is a highly sensitive political issue. Last, the personal views of students may deviate from their original ones because students may change their viewpoints by receiving more information from a variety of channels after the end of Umbrella Movement.

6.3. Recommendation and Further Investigation

The findings explore the possibilities for Liberal Studies to share some attributes of citizenship education in the present framework. Briefly speaking, the training of problem solving skills usually highlighted in Liberal Studies is in line with the conflict managing skills stressed in citizenship education. Additionally, as examined, global citizenship is the increasing trend to be emphasized in the curriculums of worldwide citizenship education, and this also share some similar topics presented in the module two and module Liberal Studies.

Educational aims of Liberal Studies, in addition to equipping students with critical and multiple-perspective thinking, should also seek to empower and motivate them to embark on their journey in pursuing the true meaning of and becoming well-informed and responsible citizens in local, national and global scales. Therefore, it will be interesting if the further investigation is conducted on base of this direction and on the foundation of the findings in this research.

Reference

Bala, M. (2005). Online Research Methods Resource for Teachers and Trainers.

http://www.celt.mmu.ac.uk/researchmethods/Modules/Data_analysis/index.php

Retrieved from May 2015

Bellamy, R. (2010). 'Introduction', in R. Bellamy and A. Palumbo (2010), *Citizenship*, Farnham, UK: Ashgate.

Bickmore, K. (2005). Teacher Development for Conflict Participation: Facilitating Learning for 'Difficult Citizenship' Education. University of Toronto. *International Journal of Citizenship and Teacher Education*

<http://www.citized.info/ejournal/Vol%201%20Number%202/007.pdf>

Retrieved from May 2015

CDC & HKEAA. (2007). *Liberal Studies Curriculum and Assessment Guide (secondary 4-6)*. Hong Kong SAR, China: Curriculum Development Council.

Retrieved from

http://334.edb.hkedcity.net/doc/eng/curriculum/LS%20C&A%20Guide_updated_e.pdf

f

Retrieved from May 2015

Delanty, G. (1997), 'Models of citizenship. Defining European identity and citizenship', *Citizenship Studies*, 1(3), 285 – 303.

Education Bureau & HKEAA. (2013). *Liberal Studies Curriculum and Assessment*

Resource Package. Hong Kong SAR, China: Education Bureau. Retrieved from http://ls.edb.hkedcity.net/LSCms/file/ENG_CARP.pdf

Retrieved from May 2015

Giddens, A. (1991). *Modernity and self-identity: self and society in the late modern age*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Habermas, J. (1996). *Between Fact and Norms: Contributions to a Discourse Theory of Law and Democracy*, Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Harvey, D. (1989). *The Condition of Postmodernity*, Oxford: Blackwell.

Hong Kong Bar Association. (2014). Statement of the Hong Kong Bar Association on the Rule of Law and Civil Disobedience.

[http://www.hkba.org/whatsnew/misc/20141008-Statement of Hong Kong Bar Association on the Rule of Law and Civil Disobedience \(English\)-FINAL\(3\).pdf](http://www.hkba.org/whatsnew/misc/20141008-Statement_of_Hong_Kong_Bar_Association_on_the_Rule_of_Law_and_Civil_Disobedience_(English)-FINAL(3).pdf)

Retrieved from May 2015

Hudson, Wayne, & Slaughter, Steven (Eds). (2007). *Globalization and Citizenship: the transnational challenge*. London and New York: Routledge.

Jameson, F. (1991). *Postmodernism, or, the Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism*, London: Verso.

Marshall, T.H. and Bottomore, T. (1992). *Citizenship and Social Class*, London: Pluto Press.

Ortmann, S. (2015). The Umbrella Movement and Hong Kong's Protracted Democratization Process. Asian Affairs. Michigan State University. Retrieved from https://www6.cityu.edu.hk/ais/doc/20150219_SO_UmbrellaMovement.pdf
Retrieved from May 2015

Rawls, J. (1972). *A Theory of Justice*, Clarendon Press, Oxford, in Rosen M. & Wolff J., 1999, *Political Thought*, Oxford University Press.

Sartori, G. (1987). *The Theory of Democracy Revisited. Part I: The Contemporary Debate*. Chatham, New Jersey: Chatham House.

Stromquist, N. P. (2009). Theorizing global citizenship: discourses, challenges, and implications for education. *Interamerican Journal of Education for Democracy*.

Tajfel, H., & Turner, J. C. (1986). The social identity theory of inter-group behaviour. In S. Worchel & L. W. Austin (Eds.), *Psychology of intergroup relations*. Chicago: Nelson-Hall.

Thomassen, L. (2007). *Within the Limits of Deliberative Reason Alone: Habermas, Civil Disobedience and Constitutional Democracy*, European Journal of Political Theory, SAGE publication.

Zinn, H. (2007). *On Civil Disobedience: An Interview with Howard Zinn*, By Cihan Aksan & Jon Bailes. <http://www.stateofnature.org/howardZinn.html>
Retrieved from May 2015

Appendices

Appendix 1: The interview account to sum up the responses from six informants during interview

Interview Accounts

Interviewees Interview Questions	Amy	Bonny	Cathy	David	Eason	Fraud
Can you learn citizenship in LS?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
LS textbooks useful for learning of citizenship?	Not quite useful, but better than none	Useful, but not enough	Useful, but not enough	Useful	Useful, but not enough	Useful, but not enough
Stance towards UM?	Support	Support	Support	Partially Support	Oppose	Oppose
**How did you participate into the movement?	Direct and Active Participation	Direct and Active Participation	Indirect and Active Participation	Indirect and Passive Participation	Non-participation	On-site observation
What lead to your decision of participation or non-participation of UM?	My responsibility to step out from comfort zone and make a better tomorrow of Hong Kong	My conscience Understanding from parent; they never stop me from going to the occupied sites	My parent and the matter of safety	My parent	I am a Chinese, won't support the action of overthrowing the Chinese rulers	My role as a student

Pressure of making their decision of participation or non-participation of UM	<p>Afraid of being arrested, but even though I was arrested, I think it is worthy</p> <p>Parent supported me but I am afraid of the potential dangers, such as violence</p>	<p>Worries from parent; but support from friends</p> <p>But if I don't go out to join the UM, I think I would have more pressure from my conscience, such as condemnation</p>	<p>Not much pressure, maybe spending more time on browsing the news of UM on facebook while loads of facebook posts from friends are related to UM made me feel a bit pressurized if I should participate.</p> <p>However, parent asked me not to go to the occupied areas for safety reason</p>	<p>Not much pressure, just have a weak feeling if I should go out to participate while few classmates were absent from the class in the morning</p> <p>Studying pressure</p> <p>No pressure from parent</p>	No pressure	A little bit pressure when having some discussion of UM with classmates
---	---	---	--	---	-------------	---

What is Citizenship? (verbal expression)	Individual Rights & Responsibility, Contribution to the Society; and a sense of belonging to somewhere you live	Rights & Responsibility Making our city and society a better place for living, respect to different opinions	Rights & Responsibility Striving for human rights and universal values	Rights & Responsibility Taking actions rather than just speaking of words, for the betterment of our society	Rights & Responsibility Country gives us a lot, and we should have contribution to our country in return, so we should be grateful (=When one drinks water, one must not forget where it comes from)	Rights & Responsibility Citizenship is an abstract subject to explicitly show your affection toward a city you are living in
What is Citizenship? (visual image i.e. one photo in the context of UM)	A little growing plant	Cheer-up notes	Wheelchair protestors	Students cleaning up the street	"I Love Hong Kong" memo	Dialogue between HKFS and HK government

Why choosing this photo to reflect citizenship in UM?	Citizenship is a developing and ever-growing concept for youngsters	<p>Multiple notes as a way to support and encourage protestors not to give up</p> <p>An umbrella as a symbol to show how humble the citizens are, and as a non-violent mean to resist the injustice</p>	<p>Social inclusion is a big part of citizenship because the disable are also parts of the society where we live in</p> <p>Even the disable participated into UM and cared much about our society, it really touched my heart</p> <p>And it seems the police treated those wheelchair users better, despite their conflicting stances</p>	Hong Kong teenagers are always labelled as “little kings and queens” and said they are spoiled. But actually, they are very self-disciplined and willing to sacrifice	<p>Love is so abstract and subjective, and no one can criticize the way how others love Hong Kong.</p> <p>The way protestor argue they are helping Hong Kong should be respected; while the way others who hope Hong Kong to get back to its normal state should also be respected.</p>	No one wants any chaotic situation to take place in Hong Kong. No one will be happy if the chaos continues. So an opportunity for both sides to negotiate, and compromise is very important
---	---	---	---	---	---	---

Major behaviors related to actualization of citizenship in the UM from interviewees' news reading / watching, observation, or personal experience	<p>Protestors are afraid of being arrested and hurt, but they still go to the frontlines of occupy sites despite all potential dangers ahead.</p> <p>Also, it is really touching my heart, especially when occupied sites expand to Mong Kok and Causeway Bay.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ♦ Open-space discussion ♦ Clean up the rubbish on the street ♦ Cheer-up each other by some humorous ways <p>A relationship of neighborhood – even though you know nothing about someone sitting next to you, you will still support each other by all ways.</p>	I have read newspaper that some Hong Kong citizens made stairs and tables for participants to walk through easily and take a rest when tired	<p>I know the behaviors shown by participants are very environmental-friendly. For example, cleaning up the street and having plants on the table of self-study areas</p> <p>Also, most of the behaviors are peaceful. Participants raised their hands while facing the pepper spray and condemned other radical protestors not to say foul language and throw water bottle to attack the police</p>	Watched the TV and knew that on 1 st October, some protestors stopped others from storming the flag-raising ceremony. It is good to show a kind of respect	<p>I only went to the occupied Admiralty once, on the night of the dialogue, after school.</p> <p>It seems that every one was looking forward to hearing any good news. Everyone was absolutely silent when the HKFS / government officials were talking. Huh sounds were usually heard after the speech of government official while applause was given to HKFS. I think it is a bit disrespect and irrational.</p>
---	--	---	--	--	---	--

Insights about citizenship during the Occupy periods of UM	Everywhere in society can be a classroom for citizenship education	<p>Citizenship can only be learnt when you practice it. And one of the main ways is participation in different affairs, not necessarily concerning political affairs, others such as voluntary work is also okay</p> <p>As long as you are helping others, you are contributing to the society</p>	<p>The power of unity is very strong.</p> <p>If every citizen unites together, it may make our world a change</p>	<p>There is no big change about citizenship in my mind</p> <p>But at least I know many teenagers and Hong Kong people do care about our city very much</p>	Not every Hong Kong citizen love and respect their nation even though they belong to that nation	It is not easy to come up with a compromise among citizens while they are divided into different camps
Conflicts concerning the understanding of citizenship	Love China v.s. love Hong Kong	<p>Non-violent, peaceful beliefs v.s. radical actions</p> <p>Obey to the laws v.s. civil disobedience</p>	<p>Obey to the laws v.s. civil disobedience</p> <p>Yellow-ribbon v.s. blue ribbon</p>	Obey to the laws v.s. civil disobedience	The role of policemen as protecting people v.s. avoiding chaos among people by enforcement	Foul language, insulting others, such as the opposing citizens and policemen v.s. respect

** Please refer to the Table 2

Appendix 2: The profiles of six interviewees

These profiles only include the interviewees' background information, ways of their participation and the photos they chose in the first part of interviews.

Profile of Amy

Amy, a form four student, is an active and direct participant of the Umbrella Movement, because she played a big role in her school – taking the lead to establish a student-led concern group for organizing class boycott aimed at showing support towards the Umbrella Movement.

She was also a member of Scholarism (學民思潮), although she did not actively engage into the work and action plans from this student organization. During the day (26/9) from which the class boycott of secondary school students started, she participated into it without any hesitation. As for the next few days, she participated into the occupation of streets outside the government headquarter.

However, she spent less time on the occupied area in Admiralty later. She explained that she went to Mongkok to continue her participation because it is closer to where she lives and studies. Since the success of occupying Mongkok, she mainly participated into the occupation there, instead of Admiralty she used to go at the beginning. She walked into the occupied site every day after school, and stayed there till the evening.

Regarding to photo cues, she chose the photo shown below to represent her learning of citizenship in the Umbrella Movement.



(Source: Google Image)

Amy illustrates citizenship by a little growing plant. She found that lots of similar plants were cultivated on the occupied flyover in Admiralty. She thinks that citizenship is like a seed to be planted into the hearts of people once they learn this concept in school. But this kind of seed can only sprout when it is ‘practiced’ out in the society. Also, she believes it is an ever-developing and ever-growing concept for youngsters.

Profile of Bonny

Bonny is a form five student. She does not belong to any student organization. She went to the occupied sites in almost every weekend and holiday. On the holiday of 1/10 and 2/10, she even slept overnight with her friends to show the unity of Hong Kong people against the unreasonable political decision made by the Beijing government.

She took part into different positions during the 79 days of occupation. Sometimes she went to the occupied site earlier in the morning, in order to help cleaning up the rubbish produced last night. Sometime she helped distributing food and drinks in the supply stations.

She said she is just a student and a girl, and that's why she never went to the frontline because of the safety issue. Whenever there were any potential danger going to take place nearby, she would leave for a while together with other protestors.

Regarding to photo cues, she chose the photo shown below to represent her learning of citizenship in the Umbrella Movement.



(Source: Google Image)

It is a picture of cheer-up notes. She said from this photo, multiple notes are seen as a way to support and encourage protestors not to give up and an umbrella as a symbol to show how humble the citizens are, and also viewed as a non-violent mean to resist the injustice

Civil disobedience against injustice is the highest form of showing citizenship. And umbrella is the symbol of this civil disobedience.

Profile of Cathy

Cathy does not directly participate into the Umbrella Movement, but she did a lot in the backdrop.

She indirectly participated into UM by actively discussing and sharing the news related to UM on social medias, particularly on facebook; as well as help making and distributing yellow ribbons in school.

Regarding to photo cues, she chose the photo shown below to represent her learning of citizenship in the Umbrella Movement.



(Source: Google Image)

The photo she chose is about a wheelchair protestor carrying a yellow umbrella.

Cathy said although she never went to the occupied sites, but some of her relatives did. Her grandfather and grandmother also went to the occupied sites for showing support. They are already old men but due to the high accessibility of the occupied site, especially the one in Admiralty, with some man-made ladder on the road to allow protestors to pass much more easily, instead of climbing over the blockers.

When she saw this photo, she said it is touching to see even the disable participated into UM and cared much about the society. Social inclusion is a big part of citizenship because the disable are also parts of the society where we live in.

And she remembers that shown on TV, it seems the police treated those the disable protestors and old men much better when it came to the holistic clear-up of the occupied site in Admiralty on the 79th day.

Profile of David

David is a form six boy who cares a lot on his study and upcoming public exams. He passively involved and participated into the movement because he simply wears yellow ribbons on his school uniforms and T-shirt every day.

He said he had kept himself informed of the Umbrella Movement but he were not able to commit himself into the movement by direct participation because there were endless exercises, exam past paper, mock exam paper ahead that he needed to work on.

He admitted that he did have a kind of feeling, although not quite strong, if he made a correct decision not to participate into the UM directly, at least few times, for witnessing such a big incident in Hong Kong, and showing his support for protestors. Sometimes he felt a bit sorry when he knew while few classmates were absent from the class in the morning, probably going to the occupied sites to show support.

However, finally he decided not go to these occupied sites because the Umbrella Movement in the later stages went against its belief. He disagrees with the violent behavior of some radical protestors, such as storming the LegCo and throwing water bottle to the police. Therefore, he partially supports the movement.

Regarding to photo cues, he chose the photo shown below to represent his learning of citizenship in the Umbrella Movement.



(Source: Google Image)

David is happy that Hong Kong teenagers are always labelled as “little kings and queens” and said they are spoiled. But actually, they are very self-disciplined and willing to sacrifice.

He knows the behaviors shown by participants are very environmental-friendly. For example, cleaning up the street and having plants on the table of self-study areas

Profile of Eason

Eason is a form four student, who comes to Hong Kong for studying secondary one a few years ago.

He said that it is unreasonable for Chinese people to create chaos with aims of overthrowing the current authority when it is in a peaceful and prosperous era. So, he did not participate into the movement.

Regarding to photo cues, he chose the photo shown below to represent his learning of citizenship in the Umbrella Movement.



(Source: Google Image)

The photo is about a memo saying ‘I love Hong Kong,’ posted on a wall during the period of the Umbrella Movement. Eason recalled in his memory that in the 79 days of the occupation, some people criticized themselves as non-Hongkonger because he was not born in Hong Kong and just has been studying in Hong Kong for three years. He felt sad. He said he also loves Hong Kong and does not understand that why the protesters defending their unlawful action of occupying streets as a way of loving Hong Kong. He understands that both groups – no matter anti-UM or pro-Um are finding some ways to ‘recuse’ Hong Kong from getting worse and worse.

From the photo, he was impressed by these four words – “I love Hong Kong”. It is obvious that this memo was written by protestors in the occupied site, but he still thinks it is good for different people to love Hong Kong in their own ways. However, he strongly hope that the way you show your love and care about Hong Kong should not be an excuse to disturb other lives in Hong Kong because everyone is supposed to live equally and have the right to lead the life they love to.

Profile of Fraud

Fraud is a form four student, whose parent is new immigrant. He studied in Hong Kong when he was at primary school level.

He is curious of knowing why many young people participated into the movement, and that's why he chose to visit the occupied site situated in Admiralty for one time

Regarding to photo cues, he chose the photo shown below to represent his learning of citizenship in the Umbrella Movement.



(Source: Google Image)

He said, “No one wants any chaotic situation to take place in Hong Kong. No one will be happy if the chaos continues. So an opportunity for both sides to negotiate, and compromise is very important. Instead of violence and confrontation against each other, while each camp represents different opinions from Hong Kong citizens, it is much better to solve the problem and conflict in a more civilized way.”

On the night at which student-government dialogue was held, he was in the occupied site of Admiralty, because he wanted to know more about it, and actually he had some free time after school. It seems that every one was looking forward to hearing any good news. Everyone was absolutely silent no matter when the HKFS or government officials were talking.

Fraud appreciates HKFS student leaders a lot because they have the courage to talk with the most senior government officials.

Appendix 3: A letter of permission for parents to allow their below-18 children's participation of research

Dear Parent,

PERMISSION LETTER TO PARENTS OF POTENTIAL CHILD PARTICIPANTS

My name is Savoy Leung, and I am now a final-year student in the programme of Bachelor of Liberal Studies at the University of Hong Kong. This year, as part of my university programme, I am required to conduct a small-scale study with senior secondary school students who have been studying the subject of Liberal Studies and participated in the umbrella movement. This study is supervised by Dr. Kwo, an Associate Professor of the University of Hong Kong.

The main theme of my investigation is students' learning of citizenship. The aim of my study is to understand what citizenship means in the eyes of senior secondary school students, and how umbrella movement affects their understanding of this concept which is salient within the curriculum of Liberal Studies. The study will involve interviews with students, lasting for around 30 minutes. The interview will be conducted in somewhere the interviewees feel comfortable and safe. Some suggested locations are the open areas of either Delia Memorial School (Hip Wo), University of Hong Kong, City University of Hong Kong, Chinese University of Hong Kong, Open University of Hong Kong, or Christian Alliance S C Chan College, depending on the preference of your child. Audio recording might be taken. You and your child have the right to review the recording and erase part of or entire recording.

According to the University's policy on the ethical conduct of research, I am writing to ask your consent for these procedures. I will make sure that all identifying information obtained from this study will be kept strictly confidential. Your child's data will be stored with a code number from which he or she cannot be personally identified on the research paper. Thus, his or her data will be anonymous. Data files will not contain potentially identifying information, and I will ensure that all the information and audio records collected will only be stored temporally by in interviewer's laptop, which is password protected, and all handwritten notes related to

the data collection will be kept in a box with a lock at the interviewer's home safely and destroyed after the information is stored in interviewer's computer. The information stored in my laptop will only be used for the dissertation and will be destroyed after the dissertation grade has been approved.

Participation in this study is voluntary, you have the right to withdraw your consent at any time without consequences, and your child can refuse to answer particular questions and/or discontinue his or her participation at any point during the course of the study with no negative consequences. Your permission in no way obligates your child to participate in the study if s/he is unwilling.

If you agree to allow your child to participate in this study, please sign below. If you have any questions about any aspect of the study, please do not hesitate to contact me for further information or clarification at 66890315. I would be happy to talk with you! Thank you for your time and consideration.

Yours sincerely,

Savoy Leung Chun Pin

I *DO NOT* consent to allow my child NAME to participate in this research, and in signing below.

signature of participant's parent

date

I consent to allow my child NAME to participate in this research, and in signing below.

signature of participant's parent

date